

Bibliographic Note and Guide to Further Research

Compiling a bibliography for a book such as this presented us with a few unexpected problems. We realized that, at best, we could offer readers only a select bibliography. As this volume already contains important selections to which readers can refer, repeating those entries in a bibliography seemed pointless. Moreover, readers can easily refer to the original works from which excerpts have been reprinted here. Most important, it made no sense to provide print sources for further research when existing digital sites list much of this literature. We therefore decided to direct readers to some important bibliographies and to a number of online sites as guides to further reading or research.

The best and most comprehensive published bibliography to date is the second edition of *Holodomor v Ukraïni 1932–1933 rr. Bibliohrafichnyi pokazhchyk* (The Holodomor in Ukraine, 1932–33: A Bibliographic Guide), compiled by L. M. Bur'ian et al. (Odesa: Studiiia Nehotsiant, 2008). The first edition, under the same title, was published in Odesa and Lviv by M. P. Kots in 2001. A select bibliography appears in Wsevolod W. Isajiw, ed., *Famine-Genocide in Ukraine, 1932–1933: Western Archives, Testimonies and New Research* (Toronto: Ukrainian Canadian Research and Documentation Centre, 2003). Also useful is Andrew Gregorovich, *Holodomor Bibliography: Ukrainian Famine-Genocide 1932–33 in English Language Resources* (Toronto: Ucrainica Research Institute, 2011).

There are many Internet sites comprising bibliographies and other resources. A bibliography by Cheryl A. Madden including many English-language titles may be found on the website of the Shevchenko Scientific Society: <http://www.shevchenko.org/famine/index.htm>. Students may also wish to consult the online *Wikipedia* entries for “Holodomor” and “Soviet famine of 1932–1933” for references. The French historian Nicolas Werth appends a brief bibliography to his article on the Ukrainian famine on the *Encyclopedia of Mass Violence* website: <http://www.massviolence.org/The-1932-1933-Great-Famine-in-Ukraine?artpage=5>. Also useful is the bibliography posted on the website of the Ukrainian Canadian Congress, Toronto Branch: <http://faminegenocide.com/resources/bibliogr.html>.

In Ukraine, the State Committee of Archives of Ukraine has established a site with a massive amount of mainly Ukrainian- and Russian-language materials and publications: <http://www.archives.gov.ua/Sections/Famine/index-eng.php>. The main section of this site contains important documentary publications that can be read online or downloaded: <http://www.archives.gov.ua/Sections/Famine/Publicat/>. Another useful page on this site is the online bibliography based on Bur'ian et al., *Holodomor v Ukraïni 1932–1933 rr.*: <http://www.archives.gov.ua/Sections/Famine/Documents/Bibliogr.php#Y1933>.

Readers should also see the section of the site established by the Institute of Ukrainian History, National Academy of Sciences of Ukraine, dedicated to research on the Holodomor: <http://www.history.org.ua/index.php?urlcrnt=projects/select.php&seriaName=golod&InProject=Holod>. This section contains the bibliography that was published in *Holod v Ukraïni 1932–1933 rokiv v Ukraïni: prychny ta naslidky* (Holodomor in Ukraine: Causes and Consequences. Kyiv: Naukova dumka, 2003): <http://www.history.org.ua/LiberUA/Book/Golodor/72.pdf>. Also useful to readers of Ukrainian is the webpage featuring back issues of *Ukraïns'kyi istorychnyi zhurnal* (Ukrainian Historical Journal), which contains many articles by leading Ukrainian historians on the famine of 1932–33: <http://www.history.org.ua/index.php?urlcrnt=JournALL/select.php&seriaName=journal>.

Those who want to conduct archival research on the Ukrainian famine should also look at the article by Hennadii Boriak in *Harvard Ukrainian Studies*: “Sources and Resources on the Famine in Ukraine’s Archival System” (vol. 27 [2004–5]: 117–47).

Articles on the Ukrainian famine can be found in many academic journals worldwide. Many university libraries offer online versions of these journals. Searches by keywords, authors’ names, and article titles will turn up many articles on the famine. We should note here that, to date, there is only one specialized journal in English, *Holodomor Studies*, dedicated specifically to the Ukrainian famine. The journal, which began appearing semiannually in 2009, publishes scholarly articles and book reviews, including contributions from scholars in Ukraine and Russia, as well as documents, some previously unpublished, all related to the Ukrainian famine. Unfortunately, an online version of this journal is not yet available.

The Ukrainian famine has been a controversial topic since the appearance of the first scholarly monograph in English, Robert Conquest’s *Harvest of Despair* (1986). Frank Sysyn discusses reactions to the appearance of Conquest’s study in his article “The Ukrainian Famine of 1932–3: The Role of the Ukrainian Diaspora in Research and Public Discussion,” in *Studies in Comparative Genocide*, ed. Levon Chorbajian and George Shirinian (London and New York: Macmillan and St. Martin’s, 1999), pp. 182–215.

The journal *Europe-Asia Studies* published a series of articles in response to a monograph by R. W. Davies and Stephen G. Wheatcroft, *The Years of Hunger: Soviet Agriculture, 1931–1933* (2004), in which the authors emphasized their disagreement with Conquest’s conclusion that the famine was the result of deliberate policy. The first article to appear in the *Europe-Asia Studies* debates was Michael Ellman, “The Role of Leadership Perceptions and of Intent in the Soviet Famine of 1931–1934” (vol. 57, no. 6, September 2005: 823–41). Davies and Wheatcroft replied in “Stalin and the Soviet Famine of 1932–1933: A Reply to Ellman” (vol. 58, no. 4, June 2006: 625–33). Ellman responded with “Stalin and the Soviet Famine of 1932–1933 Revisited” (vol. 59, no. 4, June 2007: 663–93). Earlier, Mark B. Tauger wrote “Arguing from Errors: On Certain Issues in Robert Davies’ and Stephen Wheatcroft’s Analysis of the 1932 Soviet Grain Harvest and the Great Famine of 1931–1933” (vol. 58, no. 6, September 2006: 973–84). Wheatcroft replied in “On Continuing to Misunderstand Arguments: Response to Mark Tauger” (vol. 59, no. 5, July 2007: 847–68). Hiroaki Kuromiya joined the debate with “The Soviet Famine of 1932–1933 Reconsidered” (vol. 60, no. 4, June 2008: 663–75), and David Marples wrote “Ethnic Issues in the Famine of 1932–1933 in Ukraine” (vol. 61, no. 3, May 2009: 505–18).

Much of the English-language scholarly literature on the Ukrainian famine has tended to focus on the policies and police-administrative decisions and actions of the Soviet government and Communist Party, mainly in the context of the pan-Soviet famines of the period. Readers interested in exploring these perspectives should refer to the study by Davies and Wheatcroft, *The Years of Hunger*, and the above-mentioned debates in *Europe-Asia Studies*. The excellent essay by Andrea Graziosi, “The Great Soviet Peasant War: Bolsheviks and Peasants, 1917–1933,” in his *Stalinism, Collectivization and the Great Famine* (2009), treats the famine in the context of Bolshevik policies and actions, generally hostile to the peasantry, from 1917 to 1933.

The Ukrainian famine also lends itself to consideration in wider contexts, such as the study of famines worldwide. Cormac Ó Gráda, *Famine: A Short History* (Princeton and Oxford, 2009) includes a chapter on “The Violence of Government” in which the Soviet and Ukrainian famines are briefly treated. Steven Devereaux, *Theories of Famine* (New York, London et al.:

Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1993), examines the Soviet famines, including the famine in Ukraine, as a case study in the chapter “Famine and Government Policy.” In his book *Development as Freedom* (New York: Knopf, 1999), Amartya Sen has looked at the relationship between the occurrence of famine and the lack of democracy and colonial status in the chapter on “Famines and Other Crises.”

Finally, there have been three books of note published recently in which the Ukrainian famine has been treated in broader European contexts. Timothy Snyder, *Bloodlands: Europe between Hitler and Stalin* (New York: Basic Books, 2010), contains a chapter on “The Soviet Famines” that focuses largely on Ukraine and treats the famine as one of the episodes of mass killings by Hitler and Stalin in the expanse of east-central Europe that he calls the “bloodlands.” Norman M. Naimark’s short book *Stalin’s Genocides* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2010) treats the Ukrainian famine of 1932–33 as one of Stalin’s acts of genocide. Finally, Claus Leggewie and Anne Lang place the Ukrainian famine within the context of ongoing attempts to define European identity and memory in a chapter on “Holodomor: die Ukraine ohne Platz im europäischen Gedächtnis” in *Der Kampf um die europäische Erinnerung: Ein Schlachtfeld wird besichtigt* (Munich: C. H. Beck, 2011).